A Humanistic Approach to Culturally Sensitive Clinical Supervision

Heidi A. Zetzer, Ph.D.
Associate Teaching Professor, UCSB
Director, Hosford Counseling & Psychological Services Clinic
Introduction: Heidi Zetzer, Ph.D.
Pronouns she/her/hers

- Heidi’s Background & Approach
  - Helpful Theories
  - A little bit o’ empiricism
  - Accrued wisdom

- Your Experience & Needs
A Humanistic Approach to Culturally Sensitive Clinical Supervision
Seeing, Witnessing, Prizing, & Fostering Personal/Professional Development in Therapists/Supervisees

with
Intersecting Multicultural Identities/Privileged and Subjugated Identities that emerge from a history into a sociocultural context and are infused with experience resilience, wisdom, and strengths
Why I am Calling You! 😊
Definition of Supervision
(Bernard & Goodyear, 2019, p. 9)

- An intervention provided by a more senior member of a profession to a more junior colleague or colleagues who typically (but not always) are members of that same profession. The relationship is evaluative and hierarchical, extends over time, and has the simultaneous purposes of enhancing the professional functioning of the more junior person(s); monitoring the quality of professional services offered to the clients that she, he, or they see; and serving as gatekeeper for the particular profession the supervisee seeks to enter.
Warm-Up~(W1)
Best Supervisor/Worst Supervisor

Reflection on- and in- practice
Schön (1984)
# Optimal/(In)Adequate/Harmful Supervision

*(Ellis, 2017; Ellis et al., 2014)*

## Optimal (Adequate Plus!)
- Has a culturally sensitive and articulated approach
- Strong Supervisory relationship
- Clear expectations w/ consent/contract
- Formative and summative feedback grounded in obs
- Attunement to teach-treat boundaries
- Demonstrates humility
- Mentors Th/Supee

## (In)Adequate
- Qualified
- Competent
- Consent/Contract
- Ongoing feedback based on observation
- Invested in Th/Supee
- Attentive to Diversity
- Attends to power differential

## Harmful
- Malice
- Negligence
- Sexual impropriety/intimacy
- Abuse
- Boundary violations
- Demeaning/critical
- Exploitive
Common Standard: Supervision Competencies

- (APA, 2014) Guidelines for Clinical Supervision in Health Service Psychology
  - Guidelines for Supervision in Health Service Psychology APA 2014

- ASPBB Supervision Guidelines for Experience, 2015
  - ASPPB Supervision Guidelines for Experience Leading to Licensure

- Supervision Best Practices for Supervised Professional Experience (SPE) (California Board of Psychology)
  - Supervision Best Practices re California Board of Psychology
APA Guidelines for Supervision in Health Service Psychology
Domains of Supervision Competence: Knowledge
(Falender et al., 2004, p. 778)

- Knowledge of:
  - Area being supervised (e.g., therapy, assessment, research)
  - Models, theories, modalities, & research on supervision
  - Trainee development
  - Ethics and legal issues specific to supervision
  - Evaluation, process & outcome
  - Awareness and knowledge of diversity in all forms
Domains of Supervision Competence: Skills
(Falender et al., 2004, p. 778)

- Skills
  - Supervision modalities
  - Relationship skills
  - Sensitivity and balancing of multiple roles
  - Feedback: Formative and summative
  - Assess trainee learning needs
  - Encourage and use evaluative feedback form supervisee
  - Teaching & didactic skills
  - Setting & modeling boundaries
  - Scientific thinking and research/theory to practice
Domains of Supervision Competence: Values
(Falender et al., 2004, p. 778)

- Values
  - Responsibility for clt and supervisee
  - Respect
  - Cultural awareness & responsiveness
  - Support & challenge
  - Empowerment
  - Commitment to lifelong learning
  - Balancing clinical and training needs; using research
  - Ethical principles
  - Knowing one’s limitations
“Includes awareness, knowledge, and appreciation of the three-way interaction of the client’s, the supervisee’s, and the supervisor’s values, assumptions, biases, expectations derived from worldviews, and the integration of practice assessment and intervention skills”

“Social justice and advocacy is a critical element of multicultural competence”
Social Justice

- The scholarship and professional action designed to change societal values, structures, policies, and practices, such that disadvantaged or marginalized groups gain increased access to these tools of self-determination” (Goodman et al., 2004, p. 795).

- Equality ≠ Equity
Domain B of APA Supervision Guidelines ~ Diversity (APA, 2014, pp. 15-17)

- Develop & maintain & **demonstrate**
  - Self-awareness regarding diversity competence

- Strive to **demonstrate**:
  - Enhance diversity competence
  - Establish respectful supervisory relationships
  - Facilitate diversity competence of trainees

- Recognize and **demonstrate/model**:
  - Value of training & lifelong learning
Domain B: APA Supervision Guidelines ~ Diversity
(APA, 2014, pp. 15-17)

▪ Aim to demonstrate:
  ▪ Knowledge about the effects of bias, prejudice, and stereotyping
    ▪ e.g., the impact of racial trauma on health and well-being

▪ Model:
  ▪ Client/supervisee advocacy
  ▪ How to promote change in organizations & communities
Aspire to **demonstrate** familiarity with:

- Scholarly literature on diversity competence
- Promising practices for navigating conflicts among personal and professional values to protect public
Baseline Assessment of Cultural Competence in Clinical Supervision (W2)
Cultural Competence in Supervision
Social Location
(Dee-Watts, 2010, p. 405; Enns, 2010; Falicov, 2014; Fields, 2010; Hardy, 2002)

▪ “...Social categories a person occupies and how these memberships are relevant to personal identity” (Enns, 2010, p. 333)

▪ Sources of strength and challenge (Enns, 2010)

▪ “Location of self opens the doors to dialogue on intersectionality in the therapy [and supervision] process” (Dee-Watts, 2010, p. 405)
Social Location Includes Awareness of Power, Oppression, & Privilege

- Privilege: “Unearned assets” (McIntosh, July/August, 1989, 10-12)
- Power: Power to vs power over
- Oppression: One group actively subordinating another group to forward its own interest (Jaggar, 1983, p. 6).
  - Privilege + power = oppression
  - Example from the Academy
    - Who gets “Credit” for diversity-related activities
    - The achievement “knot”
      - Underrepresented students
      - Gender non-conforming/Gender Queer/Non-Binary students
      - First Gen students
ADDRESSING Cultural Complexities in Practice & Supervision
Cultural Complexities Appear as:

- Internalized beliefs & attitudes
- External resources & barriers
- Behaviors
  - Decisions
  - Actions and...
- Impact the *whole* person

Feelings/emotions!
ADDRESSING Framework  Note where you have privilege
(Hays, 2001)

- Age & generational influences
- Developmental disabilities & acquired
- Disabilities
- Religion & Spiritual Orientation
- Ethnicity
- Socioeconomic Status
- Sexual Orientation
- Indigenous Heritage
- National Origin
- Gender
Social Location: W3

- Heidi’s Social Location
- My latest insight!

- The Importance of Remembering

- Your Social Location
- You can use ADDRESSING model or not

- The Importance of Humility
Cultural Humility (Tervalon & Murray-Garcia, 1998)

- Commitment to Lifelong Learning:
  - Self-reflection
  - Self-evaluation
  - Self-critique

- Addresses and redresses power imbalances for respectful partnerships

- Invites expressions of individual and community mores and practices that differ from one’s own

- Institutional accountability

- Cultural Humility Video
Cultural Humility (Falicov, 2014)

- Helps Avoid Two Kinds of Errors
  - Universality (underestimate)
  - Particularism (overestimate)

- Promotes
  - Both/And Thinking
  - Knowing and Not Knowing
  - Curiosity

- Reduces
  - Cultural countertransference
    - Acknowledge one’s own reactivity
Foundations for Cultivating Cultural Competence in Supervision

1. Knowledge of Integrated Developmental Model
2. Knowledge of Multicultural Identity Development
3. Helpful & Hindering Behaviors in Multicultural Supervision
Integrated Developmental Model (IDM)

- Developmental (i.e., Stoltenberg et al., 1998)
  - It’s a meta-model
  - Descriptive stages of development for supervisee, supervisor, training director, postdoctoral fellow, etc. integrated with multicultural competence, racial consciousness, multicultural supervision, etc.
Level I Trainee (B&G, 3rd ed. p. 91)

- Limited training, limited experience
  - Motivation & Anxiety High; focused on skills, want to know the “correct” or “best” answer
  - Autonomy Low; dependent on supervisor; need structure, positive feedback and little direct confrontation
  - Awareness: High self-focus, but limited self-awareness; apprehensive about evaluation
Level 2 Trainee (B&G, 3rd. ed. p. 91)

- In transition to greater autonomy and less need for direction; usually after 2-3 semesters
  - Motivation: Fluctuates; trainee vacillates from confident to unconfident and confused
  - Autonomy: Conflict between autonomy and dependency; like an adolescent! Can see pronounced resistance.
  - Awareness: Greater ability to empathize with the clt; balance still an issue; can over-identify with clt
  - This level requires skill and sense of humor!
Trainee focusing on a more personalized approach; using and understanding self in therapy

- Motivation: Consistent with occasional doubts; rarely completely immobilized
- Autonomy: A trust in own judgment, tends to be collegial as differences between Sup and Supee diminish
- Awareness: Deeper levels of self-awareness, remain focused on clt while stepping back and attending to own reactions

Level 3i (integrated): Level 3 across multiple domains; integrated; personalized; meta-competence
According to Janet Helms, “task for people of color is to resist negative societal messages and develop an empowered sense of self in the face of a racist society…”

“...the task for Whites is to develop a positive White identity based on reality and not on assumed superiority”
Racial/Cultural Identity Developmental Tasks

- Move towards greater acceptance of one’s culture and ethnicity (Ruiz, 1990).
- Commitment to eliminating all forms of oppression.
White Racial Identity Development

▪ Two Developmental Tasks:
  ▪ Abandon individual racism
  ▪ Recognize and oppose institutional and cultural racism.
Stages of Identity Development

(Atkinson, Morten, & Sue, 1998; D.W. Sue & Sue, 1990; Sue, et al., 1998)

▪ Conformity
▪ Dissonance
▪ Resistance & Immersion
▪ Introspection
▪ Integrative Awareness
Mental Health Professionals’ Adaptive Responses to Racial Microaggressions (Hernández, Carranza, & Almeida, 2010)

- Racial microaggressions are
  - “Brief, everyday exchanges that send denigrating messages to people of Color because they belong to a racial minority group” (Copodilupo et al, 2007, p. 273)

- Include:
  - Microassault
  - Microinsult
  - Microinvalidation
### Activity: Reflections on Microaggressions (W4)

#### Examples of Racial Microaggressions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Microaggression</th>
<th>Message</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Asian in your face. When Asian Americans and Latino Americans are assumed to be foreign born.</td>
<td>“Where are you from?” “Where were you born?” “You speak good English?” A person telling an Asian American to speak with words in their native language.</td>
<td>You are not American. You are a foreigner.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assumption of intelligence masking ignorance as a person of color on the basis of their race.</td>
<td>“You are a credit to your race.” “You are so articulate.” Asking African American person to help with a Math or Science problem.</td>
<td>Praise of color is generally not as intelligent as Whites. It is usually for someone of your race to be intelligent. All races are intelligent and good in Math. Science.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Color Blindness statements that indicate that a White person does not want to acknowledge race.</td>
<td>“When I look at you, I don’t see color.” “Americans are melting pot.” “There is only one color, the human color.”</td>
<td>Denying a person’s color or racial experience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classically – assumption of criminal styles. A person of color is presumed to be dangerous, criminal, or criminal on the basis of their race.</td>
<td>A White man on the street.amazoning their purse or checking their wallet as a Black or Latino appearance or passing. A cop cornered a customer of color around the store. A White person wants to ride the next elevator when a person of color is on it.</td>
<td>You are a criminal. You are going to jail. You are poor. You do not belong. You are dangerous.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denial of individualism. A statement reads when Whites deny their racial basis.</td>
<td>“I’m not a racist. I have several Black friends.” “As a woman, I know what you go through as a black minority.”</td>
<td>I am immune to races because I have friends of color. Your racial oppression is no different than my gender oppression. I don’t feel racist. I’m the way.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Myth of overworking. Statements which suggest that race does not play a role in the success.</td>
<td>“I believe the most qualified person should get the job.” “Everyone can succeed in this society. If they work hard enough.” People of color are given smaller or less beneficial opportunities because of their race. People of color are lazy and I am incompetent and need to work harder.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pathologizing suicide. racialized family life. The notion that the values and communication styles of the dominant White culture are ideal.</td>
<td>Asking a Black person. “Why do you have to be so loud / so animated?” “Just calm down.” “I’m not a problem.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Helpful & Hindering Aspects of Multicultural Supervision
(Wong, Wong, & Ishiyama, 2013)

- Theoretical Framework for Study
  - Person-centered mentoring model (PMM)

- Tenets
  - Supervisors are “intentional” mentors
  - Core conditions build climate of safety and trust
  - Core conditions give supervisees a “voice” in regard to their cultural beliefs and traditions
  - Non-directive approach facilitates self-actualization and self-evaluation
  - Mentoring facilitates personal and professional development
20 Positive Themes

- Relationship
  - Safe trusting relationship (56%)
  - Treated w/ respect (36%)
  - Freedom to grow (36%)

- Competence
  - Clear helpful feedback (72%)
  - Valuable learning (52%)
  - Sup role played demonstrated etc (36%)

- Personal attributes of supervisor
  - Appreciative, accepting, encouraging (80%)

- Mentoring (64%)
  - Growth through negative experiences (40%)
15 Negative Themes

- Personal difficulties because of minority status (64%)
  - Linguistic/cultural diff w/ clients and in group sup
  - Especially on passive/assertive dimension

- Bad or harmful supervisors
  - Rigid/judgmental (60%)
  - Unprofessional; unethical (48%)
  - Feeling “unsafe, worried, stressed out” (56%)

- Lack of cross-cultural competencies (56%)
  - Stereotyping (16%)
  - Absence of diversity in the department (8%)

- Conflicts politics and discrimination (52%)
  - Conflict with supervisor’s approach to treatment (28%)
Focuses on “how the supervisees are treated rather than how they are trained”

“...primary focus is on personal encounters and a genuine caring relationship”

“I recognize the power that mentors had in inspiring me to strive for my dreams. Having people who believed in me gave me a sense of hope when discouragement set in” (Corey, Haynes, Moulton, & Muratoni, 2010, p. 44).

Person-Centered Mentoring Model (Wong et al., 2013, p. 79)
Queer People of Color Resilience-Based Model of Supervision (Singh & Chun, 2010)

Within each circle include influence of:
Awareness of Privilege & Oppression, Supervisor Empowerment, & Affirmation of Diversity
Activity: QPOC Supervisor Questions for Reflection (W5)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supervisory Performance Dimension</th>
<th>Questions for Reflection</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Affirmation of Emotion</td>
<td>1. How might the supervisor's actions align with the supervisee's emotional state?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisor Empowerment</td>
<td>2. How have the supervisor's actions empowered the supervisee to take charge of their own development?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisory Technical Expertise</td>
<td>3. How have the supervisor's technical expertise contributed to the supervisee's learning and growth?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisory Support for Learning</td>
<td>4. How has the supervisor provided adequate support for the supervisee's learning and development?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisory Cultural Sensitivity</td>
<td>5. How has the supervisor demonstrated cultural sensitivity and awareness in their interactions with the supervisee?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisory Ethical Conduct</td>
<td>6. How have the supervisor's ethical conduct set a positive example for the supervisee to emulate?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Best Practices: Tending to the Personal & Professional Development of the Therapist(s)

Beginning of Supervision
- Locate self
- Express cultural humility
- Clarify expectations
- Show method of evaluation
- Use supervision contract
- Establish group norms
- Teach how to provide feedback

Middle of Supervision
- Check in periodically
- Provide formative evaluation
- Tend to teach-treat boundary
- Engage in reflection on practice
- Consult
- Mentor
Best Practices

Tend to Ruptures in the Supervisory Alliance

- Self-reflection
- Self-interrogation
- Consultation
- Consider modeling or use parallel process
- Repair
  - “Turn a distressing moment into an empathic moment”

Ending/Wrapping Up

- Invite reflection-on-practice
- Provide summative evaluation
- Affirm strengths
- Set goals for next phase
- Launch!
Selected References


Thank You!

You are a child of the universe no less than the trees and the stars; you have a right to be here. And whether or not it is clear to you, no doubt the universe is unfolding as it should.